

**JOURNAL OF BUDDHIST STUDIES**

**VOLUME XIII, 2016**

**CENTRE FOR BUDDHIST STUDIES, SRI LANKA  
&  
THE BUDDHA-DHARMA CENTRE OF HONG KONG**

**© Centre for Buddhist Studies, Sri Lanka &  
The Buddha-Dharma Centre of Hong Kong**

ISBN 978-988-16820-1-7

**Published by**  
Centre for Buddhist Studies, Sri Lanka &  
The Buddha-Dharma Centre of Hong Kong  
with the sponsorship of  
the Glorious Sun Charity Group, Hong Kong (旭日慈善基金).

## EDITORIAL CONSULTANTS

**Ratna HANDURUKANDE** Ph.D.

Professor Emeritus, University of Peradeniya

**Y KARUNADASA** Ph.D.

Professor Emeritus, University of Kelaniya

Visiting Professor, The Buddha-Dharma Centre of Hong Kong

**Oliver ABEYNAYAKE** Ph.D.

Professor Emeritus, Buddhist and Pali University of Sri Lanka

Visiting Professor, The Buddha-Dharma Centre of Hong Kong

**Chandima WIJEBANDARA** Ph.D.

Professor, University of Sri Jayawardhanapura

**Sumanapala GALMANGODA** Ph.D.

Professor, University of Kelaniya

**Toshiichi ENDO** Ph.D.

Associate Professor, Centre of Buddhist Studies

The University of Hong Kong

## EDITOR

**Bhikkhu KL DHAMMAJOTI** 法光

Director, The Buddha-Dharma Centre of Hong Kong.

Chair Professor, School of Philosophy, Renmin University of China.



## CONTENTS

Rehabilitating the <i>Pudgalavādins</i> : Monastic Culture of the Vātsīputrīya-Saṃmitīya School Peter SKILLING	1
The Buddha's Omniscient Knowledge ( <i>sabbaññuta-ñāṇa</i> ): Pāli Commentarial Interpretations Toshiichi ENDO	55
The Robes of a <i>Bhikkhunī</i> Oskar von HINÜBER and Bhikkhu ANĀLAYO	79
The <i>Upasampadā</i> of Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī in the Mūlasarvāstivāda <i>Vinaya</i> and a <i>Sūtra</i> Quotation in the Śamathadeva's <i>Abhidharmakośopāyikā-ṭīkā</i> Bhikkhunī DHAMMADINĀ	91
<i>Bhava</i> and <i>Vibhava</i> in Early Buddhism G.A. SOMARATNE	123
What Happened to the Majority? Observations about Early Buddhist Schools Charles WILLEMEN	141
<i>Kleśaprahāṇa</i> , <i>Pratyakṣa</i> and Discriminative Discernment Sarvāstivāda Doctrines and Later Yogācāra Discussion KL DHAMMAJOTI	155
<i>Traditional Theravāda Meditation and Its Modern-Era Suppression</i> Reviewed by Asanga TILAKARATNE	191



# CONTRIBUTORS

(In alphabetical order)

Bhikkhu **ANĀLAYO** Ph.D., D.Lit.  
Professor,  
Numata Center for Buddhist Studies,  
University of Hamburg.

Bhikkhunī **DHAMMADINNĀ** Ph.D.  
Associate Research Professor,  
Dharma Drum Institute of Liberal Arts, Taiwan.  
Director, Āgama Research Group,  
Dharma Drum Buddhist College, Taiwan.

Bhikkhu **KL DHAMMAJOTI** Ph.D.  
Director,  
The Buddha-Dharma Centre of Hong Kong.  
Chair Professor,  
School of Philosophy, Renmin University of China.

Toshiichi **ENDO** Ph.D.  
Associate Professor,  
Centre of Buddhist Studies,  
The University of Hong Kong.

Oskar von **HINÜBER** Ph.D., D.Lit.  
Professor Emeritus,  
University of Freiburg.

Peter **SKILLING** Ph.D.  
Professor,  
French School of Asian Studies (EFEO), Bangkok.  
Special Lecturer,  
Chulalongkorn University, Bangkok.

**G.A. SOMARATNE Ph.D.**  
Assistant Professor,  
Centre of Buddhist Studies,  
The University of Hong Kong.

**Asanga TILAKARATNE Ph.D.**  
Professor and Head,  
Buddhist Studies Unit,  
The University of Colombo.

**Charles WILLEMEN Ph.D.**  
Professor and Rector,  
International Buddhist College, Thailand.



# The *upasampadā* of Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī in the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya* and a *sūtra* Quotation in Śamathadeva's *Abhidharmakośopāyikā-ṭīkā*

Bhikkhunī DHAMMADINNĀ

## Introduction

The going forth and full acceptance or higher ordination (*upasampadā*) of Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī opens the history of the Buddha's female monastic community and marks a historical moment in early Buddhism when the Teacher's fourfold assembly (*catusparīṣat*) first comes into existence in the world.<sup>1</sup>

In fact, the Sarvāstivāda and Mūlasarvāstivāda traditions know of fully-fledged nuns already in the dispensation of past Buddhas, who are held to have established fourfold assemblies just like the present Buddha.<sup>2</sup> This notion emerges from the Sarvāstivāda and Mūlasarvāstivāda canonical accounts of the first *saṅgīti*, in which Ānanda refers to past Buddhas who also had four assemblies. The Theravāda tradition also knows of nun disciples of past Buddhas, although this is attested only in the commentaries and the *Buddhavaṃsa*, a verse description of the lineage of twenty-four Buddhas of the past up to the present Buddha, included in the *Khuddhaka-nikāya* of the Pali Tipiṭaka.<sup>3</sup>

According to the foundation history of the Buddhist female monastic community, Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī's *upasampadā* into the early Buddhist monastic community took place by her agreement to lifelong observance of the eight *gurudharmas*.

In a nutshell, most of these eight principles to be respected regulate the legal and institutional relationship of Buddhist nuns as individuals and as a celibate community with Buddhist monks, a relationship that is based on a principle of hierarchical subordination of the former to the latter, with the monks being in turn responsible to provide exhortation and protection to the nuns. Such a hierarchical subordination is essentially gender-based and it comes combined with the anteriority and thereby seniority of the monks' community as a whole, having been founded

by the Buddha before the nuns' community. Although among Buddhist monastics in general the paying of homage is usually done according to seniority of ordination, this principle does not override the gender divide wherein nuns who are either junior or senior to a monk are expected to pay homage to the monk.

Most of the eight *gurudharmas* are included in the nuns' *Vibhaṅgas* and thus in the respective *prātimokṣas* of the canonical *Vinayas*, with details varying in this respect across different *Vinayas*.<sup>4</sup>

The foundation narrative functions as the legal and ideological aetiology for the establishment of the female monastic order. Accordingly, ordination by acceptance of the *gurudharmas* features in listings of legitimate types of ordinations in Buddhist jurisprudence and other contexts.<sup>5</sup> Such listings lay down types of ordination that are fit to stand in terms of legality as well as types of ordination that no longer apply, in that they were legal within their original context of promulgation but their application was exceptional, bound to specific circumstances. For example, the '*ehi bhikṣu*' or 'Come, monk' formula was a prerogative of the Buddha as the founder of the monastic community who would directly accept monk disciples into his *saṅgha*, but it was never available as a form of ordination that individual monks or the *saṅgha* could deploy for the ordination of new monks.

Similarly, the case of Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī's going forth and acceptance as a fully-fledged member of the *saṅgha* is considered a unique event in the history of the present dispensation established by the Buddha Śākyamuni. Although from a legal standpoint no longer applicable immediately right after the inception of the nuns' order, her *upasampadā* by acceptance of the *gurudharmas* continued and still continues to furnish an essential legal and ideological frame for the order of nuns.

As far as the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya* tradition is concerned, when Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī accepts the *gurudharmas*, then she and the five hundred Śākyan women of her following are declared to have gone forth, to have received the higher ordination, and to have become nuns therewith. This is clearly stated at the conclusion of the account of Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī's successful impetration and acceptance of the *gurudharmas* in the *Kṣudrakavastu* of the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya*, with the earlier sections of the same account presenting her acting as a group leader and interlocutor at the head of her following. The Buddha is on record for declaring to the venerable Upāli that Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī and the five

hundred women are thereby fully ordained.<sup>6</sup> The same scenario is found in a text preserved in a Sanskrit fragmentary manuscript that was initially identified as a Mūlasarvāstivāda *karmavācanā* but that might have been directly extracted from the *Kṣudrakavastu* of a Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya*.<sup>7</sup> On the other hand, in view of the precedence assigned to the group leader and her central role in the narrative, it is only natural to find that in the lists of types of ordination the undertaking of the eight *gurudharmas* on the part of Gautamī is not accompanied by a reference to her followers.<sup>8</sup>

As regards the broader legal history of the transition from early to later forms of nun ordination, a detailed study of the account of the ordination of the five hundred Śākyan followers (or generically a multitude of numerous women, as in the Theravāda *Vinaya*) as presented by each of the canonical *Vinayas* alongside the legal perspective expressed by their respective commentarial traditions remains a desideratum, as is an in-depth comparative study of the early stages of development of the nuns' *saṅgha* in general.<sup>9</sup>

It may not be an exaggeration to state that the eight *gurudharmas*, embedded within the foundation narrative, are perhaps the most well-known part of the nuns' *Vinaya*(s) in the Buddhist traditions throughout the ages.

A pointer to the critical significance of this narrative is the apparent extrapolation of the whole *gurudharmas* cluster from the main body of the Sanskrit Mahāsāṅghika-Lokottaravāda *Bhikṣuṇī-vinaya* and its placement at the onset of the received *Bhikṣuṇī-vinaya* of this school, before the *Bhikṣuṇī-prātimokṣa-vibhaṅga* section.<sup>10</sup> This arrangement is achieved by extracting the *gurudharmas* cluster from the *Skandhaka* section of the Mahāsāṅghika *Vinaya*. As already pointed out by Gustav Roth, this movement of text acquires its rationale from the arrangement and composition of the Mahāsāṅghika-Lokottaravāda *Bhikṣuṇī-Vinaya* with the intent to supply a complete, self-contained set of the nuns' *Vinaya* as a whole.<sup>11</sup>

A tendency for the foundation narrative (including the *gurudharmas* cluster) to be given place of pride is only natural in view of its encoding of the monastic identity of the female order. From the scriptural corpus of a historically discontinued monastic lineage such as the Mahāsāṅghika-Lokottaravāda to living traditions, the narrative is for the same reason placed in the *Cullavagga* among the *Khandhakas* of the Theravāda *Vinaya* and the *Kṣudrakavastu* of the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya*, which, broadly speaking, contain materials related to the establishment of the *saṅgha* as

a whole. The Dharmaguptaka *Vinaya* instead places it in the \**Bhikṣuṇī-skandhaka*, thus without special structural prominence in this respect.<sup>12</sup>

The critical significance of this narrative is not limited to traditional or modernised Buddhist societies in Asia, even where the nuns' order has ceased to exist and has been replaced by liminal forms of female renunciation, but it also extends to Buddhist monastic and lay communities in the West. In fact, even non-Buddhists who encounter the Buddhist religious traditions have in one way or the other come to terms with this script.

With the advent of the digital era and the wide distribution of information and circulation of opinions, philological studies and the text-historical method have made their impact outside academia. More or less correct dissemination of academic findings on the alleged non-historicity of the *gurudharmas* has provided the basis for a progressive rejection of the validity of the *gurudharmas* and their legally binding nature. This has often taken place on the basis of a discourse that is alien to the legal and intellectual history of the Buddhist tradition and its scholasticism.

At times a liberal approach to the letter of the *Vinaya* as against its spirit has been used to suggest the removal of the *gurudharmas* on the grounds of their conflict with the mainstream notion of gender equality as a universal human right. However, from an institutional perspective, the structural subordination of the nuns to monks in the *Vinaya* as the basic chart for community life—starting from the impossibility in any of the three living monastic traditions (Dharmaguptaka, Theravāda and Mūlasarvāstivāda) to complete a nun ordination without the involvement of monks—is an objective state of affairs that needs to be recognised as such. Regardless of the fact that in their present formulation the *gurudharmas* presumably stand at the end of a process of redactional development that reflects the male monastic community's increasing fear and control of the female community, institutional androcentrism (and yet inclusive of women) remains a constitutional component of the Buddhist monastic society (monks and nuns) as encoded, or enshrined, in the *Vinaya* as a whole.

Given the crucial legal and ideological import of this narrative, it is at once unsurprising and somewhat ironic that the legal implications of one of the principles of 'subordination' of nuns to monks has afforded a legitimate base for the contemporary revival of the *bhikkhūṇī-saṅgha* in the Theravāda tradition, reopening the doors to 'lawful' female renunciation in the Theravāda *saṅgha*.<sup>13</sup> This has allowed the

reestablishment of the *bhikkhunī-saṅgha* to stand on firm legal grounds that can be deemed acceptable by Theravāda legal traditionalists. The irony of this ‘re-foundation history’ is that, quite apart from gender discourse and campaigning, it has been made possible by exploiting one of the chief culprits of gender-based inequality.<sup>14</sup>

A to some degree comparable dynamics is observable in the debate on the *gurudharmas* arisen in Taiwan in the 1990s, a debate which was a by-product of the controversy revolving around the introduction of dual ordination as opposed to the earlier custom of monks (only) ordaining *bhikṣuṇīs*. Li Yu-chen (2008: 197–198) reasons that “[a]s the competition over the ordination system emerged in the 1990s, ironically the incorporation of the eight *gurudharmas* has become a way to legitimise dual ordination. Especially, dual ordination is equated with modernisation as a way of recruiting more and more educated women. Hence, the more legitimate dual ordination becomes, the more likely the eight *gurudharmas* are to attract attention. In this way, there exists a contradictory relationship between dual ordination and the eight *gurudharmas*; the former maintains the autonomy of the Bhikṣuṇī Saṅgha at the same time that the latter confines nuns to a subordinate religious status. If one examines the eight *gurudharmas* literally, this set of rules guarantees the existence and empowerment of Buddhist nuns institutionally by giving nuns the right to administrate women’s ordination, transgressions, retreats, and education. Of course, the eight *gurudharmas* endow monks with a higher status than nuns, because it was monks who initiated and initially supervised the monastic membership of women. But nuns have institutional access and relatively full membership. This is the primary point for women’s participation in the clerical hierarchy. ... dual ordination is the crucial determinant in maintaining [the nuns’] strong identity, even though it exposes the historical interpretation of the eight *gurudharmas* that sparked the 1992 debate. Ironically, the debate over the *gurudharmas* has become a code both for ordained women’s legitimacy and their subjugated status within the Saṅgha. This institutional subjugation is both disempowering and degrading, especially when viewed from within the contemporary cultural context; hence, it is being challenged. How can Buddhism be culturally relevant if it requires the subordination of monastic women?” The idea that the *gurudharmas* were instrumental in enabling nuns to become monastic members, and thereby the importance of keeping them, is not only discussed in the context of the Taiwanese revival of *bhikṣuṇī* ordination, but it is also conceptualised by contemporary nuns in Mainland China.<sup>15</sup>

The legal ‘irony’ of the eight *gurudharmas* has yet another parallel in the case of the Tibetan and Himalayan tradition, which is the only surviving heir to this day of the ancient Indian Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya* lineage. Recent academic findings indicate that the legal implications of one of the *gurudharmas* might be able to provide a lawful key to the controversy over the introduction of *bhikṣuṇī* ordination in the Tibetan Mūlasarvāstivāda tradition.<sup>16</sup>

### **The Mūlasarvāstivāda Versions of Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī’s *upasampadā***

With this article I provide an English rendering of the version of the foundation account transmitted in the *Kṣudrakavastu* of the Tibetan translation of a Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya*. This translation was conducted on the basis of a Sanskrit original and is attributed to Vidyākara Prabha, Dharmasrībhadra and dPal ’gyor, who were active in Tibet in the early ninth century.<sup>17</sup> A parallel version is included in the Chinese translation of the *Kṣudrakavastu* of a Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya* which was carried out by Yijing (義淨) in the early eighth century.<sup>18</sup>

Yet another Mūlasarvāstivāda witness is found as a canonical quotation included in Śamathadeva’s repertory of canonical quotations in the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*, the *Abhidharmakośopāyikā-ṭīkā*, a work presently only extant in Tibetan translation and included in the Tanjur.<sup>19</sup> The *Abhidharmakośopāyikā-ṭīkā* contains altogether eight quotations of passages from the *Kṣudrakavastu* of the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya*, and five of them include references to the *uddānas* in the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya*.<sup>20</sup> The canonical quotation in question is extracted from a discourse version of the foundation account, titled \**Mahāprajāpatī-gautamī-sūtra*.<sup>21</sup> The text is a partial parallel that includes only the section with the promulgation of the eight *gurudharmas*.<sup>22</sup> I translate this quotation following the *Kṣudrakavastu Vinaya* version.<sup>23</sup>

A further parallel discourse version stemming from a collection that is generally ascribed to a Sarvāstivāda tradition of reciters is included under the title \**Gautamī-sūtra* (瞿曇彌經) in the Chinese translation of the *Madhyama-āgama*.<sup>24</sup>

A discourse individually translated into Chinese, found as entry no. 60 of the Taishō edition (瞿曇彌記果經), is closely similar to the account of Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī’s ordination in the *Madhyama-āgama*. As pointed out by Bhikkhu Anālayo (2016a: 2–3), T 60 and the *Madhyama-āgama* version stem from very closely related transmission lineages,

which in turn makes it highly probable that they were both transmitted by reciters belonging to the Greater Sarvāstivāda textual milieu.

The passage in the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya* (chapter four) taken by Śamathadeva as his point of departure is a mention of ordination through acceptance of the eight *gurudharmas* that is included in a listing of the valid types of ordination I mentioned earlier. This list provides the ten types of ordination that were recognised by the *Vinaya* experts of the Vaibhāṣika school. The context in which the list appears is a discussion on the nature of various forms of discipline or restraint (*saṃvara*), the discipline of *prātimokṣa* being one of them.

To remain within the sphere of Abhidharma commentaries, a short gloss in Yaśomitra's *Sphuṭārthā Abhidharmakośavyākhyā* taking up the same passage in the fourth chapter of the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya* also supplies the headings of the *gurudharmas*, with the sequence of the rules differing among the received Sanskrit text and the extant Tibetan translation in the Tanjur.<sup>25</sup>

Last, a complete direct Sanskrit source or parallel stemming from a Mūlasarvāstivāda tradition of reciters is not available, with the exception of the already mentioned partial parallel in Sanskrit preserved in a fragmentary palm-leaf manuscript that has been identified as a *Bhikṣuṇī-karmavācānā* (Oxford Sanskrit Ms. 1442), similarly stemming from a Mūlasarvāstivāda lineage of transmission and dated to the twelfth or thirteenth century on palaeographic basis.<sup>26</sup> On closer scrutiny, Jin-il Chung has suggested that the text contained by this manuscript may not be a *karmavācānā*, but rather a section of the *Vinaya Kṣudrakavastu*. On the basis of the manuscript pagination, it is unlikely that it could go back to a complete Sanskrit *Kṣudrakavastu*. The first extant folio of the manuscript begins on page no. 3 with Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī repeating her request that women should be allowed to go forth, in the form in which this is reported by Ānanda to the Buddha. It is thus probable that the text was handed down independently, possibly directly extracted from the *Kṣudrakavastu*.<sup>27</sup> The inclusion of narrative sections would be indeed out of place in a *karmavācā*, thus it is possible that the text might belong to a *Vinaya* handbook that contained the fundamentals of nuns' ordination, starting from the foundation history, not different from the above described situation of the Mahāsāṃghika-Lokottaravāda *Bhikṣuṇī-vinaya* edited by Gustav Roth.



As recent progress in scholarship is evidencing, the lines of transmission of the two Indic traditions underlying the Tibetan and Chinese translations of the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya* are closely connected but by no means identical. In addition to this, even within the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya* corpus represented in the Tibetan Tripiṭaka, evidence for diversity of transmission lineages is becoming increasingly evident.<sup>28</sup>

I defer a comparative study of the *Abhidharmakośopāyikā-ṭīkā* version within the context of the literary corpus that emerged from within the variegated textual world of the Sarvāstivāda/Mūlasarvāstivāda communities in India, including a comparative study of the *gurudharmas* in the Sarvāstivāda and Mūlasarvāstivāda versions and discussion of the differences in wording, to a publication under preparation.<sup>29</sup> The table below may suffice to offer a survey of the variations in the *gurudharmas* listing, which is a clear pointer to diversity within the Sarvāstivāda and Mūlasarvāstivāda textual milieus. An asterisk (\*) signals major wording dissimilarities that qualify for a different version of a rule.

<i>Kṣudraka-vastu</i> (Tib.)	<i>Kṣudraka-vastu</i> (Chin.)	<i>Kṣudraka-vastu</i> (Chin.), <i>uddāna</i>	So-called <i>Bhikṣuṇī-karma-vācanā</i>	<i>Upāyikā</i>	<i>Vyākhyā</i> (Skt.)	<i>Vyākhyā</i> (Tib.)	MĀ 116 & T 60
1 going forth, full acceptance	(1) going forth, full acceptance	(1) full acceptance	(1) going forth, full acceptance	(1) going forth, full acceptance	(1) full acceptance	(8) <sup>30</sup>	(1) going forth, full acceptance
2 exhortation	(2)	(2)	(2)	(2)	(2)	(5)	(2)
3 rains	(3)	(3)	(3)	(3)	(3)	(2)	(3)
4 invitation	(5)	(5)	(4)	(4)	(4)	(3)	(4)
5 monk's faults	(6)	(6)	(5)	(5)	(5)	(4)	(*)
6 monk's rebuke	(8)	(8)	(6)	(6)	(7)	(6)	(6)
7 penance	(7)	(7)	(7)	(7)	(8)	(7)	(7)
8 homage	(4)	(4)	(8)	(8)	(6)	(8)	(8)

### Translation of Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī's *upasampadā* in the *Kṣudraka-vastu* of the Tibetan Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya*<sup>31</sup>

The Buddha, the Blessed One, was staying at Kapilavastu, in the Nyagrodha Park.

Then Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī, together with five hundred Śākyan women, proceeded to the presence of the Blessed One, arrived, paid homage with her head to the feet of the Blessed One and sat down to one side.



The Blessed One instructed Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī, who was sitting to one side, with a discourse on the Dharma, exhorted her in various ways, uplifted<sup>[P<sup>97b</sup>]</sup> and much delighted her. After he had instructed Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī with a discourse on the Dharma through numerous expositions, exhorted her in various ways, uplifted and much delighted her, [the Blessed One] remained silent. Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī rose from her seat, paid homage with her hands folded towards the Blessed One and asked the Blessed One: “Venerable sir, if for a woman there is a possibility to attain the four fruits of recluseship,<sup>[D<sup>100b</sup>]</sup> I request that women may go forth (*pravrajyā*) into the well-taught Dharma and Discipline, receive the full acceptance (*upasampadā*), become nuns, and that women may practice the pure conduct (*brahmacarya*) under the Blessed One.”

The Blessed One instructed Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī: “Gautamī, you should stay at home, dress in white robes,<sup>32</sup> practice the conduct that is entirely perfect, pure and accomplished in purity, and there will be benefit, well-being and happiness for you for a long time.”<sup>33</sup>

For a second and a third time Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī again requested the Blessed One: “Venerable sir, if for a woman there is a possibility to attain the four fruits of recluseship, I request that women may go forth in the well-taught Dharma and Discipline, receive the full acceptance, become nuns, and practice the pure conduct under the Blessed One.”

The Blessed One a second and a third time again instructed Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī: “Gautamī, you should stay at home, dress in white robes, practice the conduct that is entirely perfect, pure and accomplished in purity, and there will be benefit, well-being and happiness for you for a long time.”

Thereupon [the request of] Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī was turned down for three times by the Blessed One.<sup>[P<sup>98a</sup>]</sup> She paid homage with her head at the feet of the Blessed One and took leave from the presence of the Blessed One.

Then the Blessed One, who had been staying in Kapilavastu at his wish, took his alms bowl and robe and left. He went to various locations according to his wish. Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī heard that the Blessed One, who had been staying in Kapilavastu at his wish, had taken his alms bowl and robe, had left, and that he had gone to various locations according to his wish.<sup>[D<sup>101a</sup>]</sup> Having heard it, together with the five-hundred Śākyan women, they shaved their own heads and put on monastic robes.<sup>34</sup> With shaven heads and wearing patchwork robes,<sup>35</sup> they would go after the

Blessed One wherever [they heard] he had spent the [previous] night. At that point the Blessed One, who had been wandering across the country of the Vṛjī, arrived at the territory of Nāḍikā and went to stay in Nāḍikā, in the Kuñjikāvasatha.<sup>36</sup>

Then Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī, her body fatigued, exhausted, worn out and covered in dust, suffering, proceeded to the presence of the Blessed One. She arrived there, paid homage with her head at the feet of the Blessed One and sat down to one side. While she was sitting at one side, the Blessed One instructed Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī with a discourse on the Dharma through numerous expositions, exhorted her in various ways, uplifted and much delighted her. After he had instructed Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī with a discourse on the Dharma through numerous expositions, having exhorted her in various ways, uplifted and much delighted her, the Blessed One remained completely silent.

Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī rose from her seat, paid homage with her hands folded [in homage] towards the Blessed One and asked the Blessed One: “Venerable sir, if for a woman there is a possibility to attain the four fruits of recluseship, I request that women may go forth in the well-taught Dharma and Discipline, receive the full acceptance, become nuns, and practice the pure conduct under the Blessed One.”

The Blessed One answered thus to Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī: “Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī, just like this, day and night, for the whole life, shaving your head and wearing patch robes, day and night, for the whole life, you should practice the conduct that is entirely perfect, pure and accomplished in purity, and there will be benefit, well-being and happiness for you for a long time.”

Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī for the second and for a third time again requested to the Blessed One: “Venerable sir, if for a woman there is a possibility to attain the four fruits of recluseship, I request that women may go forth in the well-taught Dharma and Discipline, receive the full acceptance, become nuns, and practice the pure conduct under the Blessed One.”

The Blessed One for the second and for a third time again [said] to Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī: “Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī, just like this, day and night, for the whole life, shaving your head and wearing patch robes, day and night, for the whole life, you should practice the conduct that is entirely perfect, pure and accomplished in purity, and there will be benefit, well-being and happiness for you for a long time.”

Because the Blessed One had not given permission for a second and a third time, Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī went to stand at one side, outside the entrance [of the monastery] and remained there, crying.

The venerable Ānanda saw Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī standing at one side, outside the entrance, and that she was staying there crying. Having seen it, he said to Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī: “Gautamī, why are you standing at one side, outside the entrance, and why are you staying there crying?”. [Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī replied:] “Venerable Ānanda, women are not permitted to go forth in the well-taught Dharma and Discipline, receive the full acceptance, become nuns.” [Ānanda said:] “Gautamī, if it is like that, remain here and I will inquire from the Blessed One.”

Then the venerable Ānanda proceeded to the presence of the Blessed One, arrived there, honoured with his head the feet of the Blessed One and sat down to one side. Sitting to one side, the venerable Ānanda requested the Blessed One: “Venerable sir, if for a woman there is a possibility to attain the four fruits of recluship, once women have gone forth in the well-taught Dharma and Discipline, received full acceptance and have become nuns, I request that women may practice the pure conduct under the Blessed One.” [D 102a]

[The Buddha] instructed him: “Ānanda, do not request that women go forth in the well-taught Dharma and Discipline, receive the full acceptance and become nuns. For what reason? Ānanda, a well-taught Dharma and Discipline in which women [have been permitted to] go forth will not last long.

[1. simile of the assaulted household]

Ānanda, just as for example with a household which has many women and [only] a few men, robbers and kidnappers will take it over again and again. Ānanda, in just the same way, a Dharma and Discipline in which women [have been permitted to] go forth will not last long.

[2. simile of the ruined *sāli* rice]

Ānanda, just as for example if a landowner’s field of *sāli* rice, which has perfectly grown, is hit by intense hailstorms,<sup>37</sup> the *sāli* rice will be weakened, very weakened and then become unfit and unserviceable. Ānanda, in just the same way, a Dharma and Discipline in which women [have been permitted to] go forth will not last long.

[3. simile of the ruined sugar cane]

Ānanda, just as for example if a country householder has planted plenty of sugar cane plants and the sugar cane plants become diseased and ruined. Ānanda, in just the same way, a Dharma and Discipline in which women [have been permitted to] go forth will not last long.

Nevertheless, Ānanda, for women I establish eight *gurudharmas*, in order to restrain the faults of women, which are not to be transgressed. Women are to observe these principles for their whole lives. It is just as, Ānanda, a water channel or a dam [built] by a householder farmer in the autumn after the rainy season has passed, such that the water will be contained and will not overflow. Just in the same way, Ānanda, I establish eight *gurudharmas* which are restraining the faults of women and are not to be transgressed. Women are to observe them for their whole lives. <sup>[P<sup>99b</sup>]</sup> What are the eight?

[1. going forth and full acceptance]

Ānanda, women are to receive the going forth in the homeless life and receive the full acceptance into the monastic life, become nuns, from the monks. Ānanda, I promulgate this as the first *gurudharma*, which is not to be transgressed, so that women may restrain their faults. Women are to observe it for their whole lives.

[2. exhortation]

Ānanda, every half month the nuns should request instruction from the monks. Ānanda, I promulgate this as the second *gurudharma*, which is not to be transgressed, so that women may restrain their faults. Women are to observe it for their whole lives.

[3. rains residency]

Ānanda, a nun cannot enter the rains in a place where there are no monks. Ānanda, I promulgate this as the third *gurudharma*, which is not to be transgressed, so that women may restrain their faults. Women are to observe it for their whole lives.

[4. invitation]

Ānanda, a nun who has entered the rains has to undertake an invitation from both communities in three aspects, in regard to what has been seen, heard or suspected. Ānanda, I promulgate this as the fourth *gurudharma*, which is not to be transgressed, so that women may restrain their faults. Women are to observe it for their whole lives.

[5. not to speak of a monk's faults]

Ānanda, a nun who sees that there is a breach in relation to a monk's morality, a breach in relation to a monk's view, a breach in relation to a monk's conduct, or a breach in relation to a monk's livelihood, has to refrain from reporting it and reminding him of it. A monk who sees that there is a breach in relation to a nun's morality, a breach in relation to a nun's view, a breach in relation to a nun's conduct, or a breach in relation to a nun's livelihood, is not prohibited from reporting it and reminding her of it. Ānanda, I promulgate this as the fifth *gurudharma*, which is not to be transgressed, so that women may restrain their faults. Women are to observe it for their whole lives.

[6. not to rebuke a monk]

Ānanda, a nun is not to rebuke, show anger towards, or threaten a monk. Ānanda, it is not allowed that a nun rebukes, shows anger towards, or threatens a monk. Ānanda, I promulgate this as the sixth *gurudharma*, which is not to be transgressed, so that women may restrain their faults. Women are to observe it for their whole lives.

[7. penance]

Ānanda, a nun who has transgressed against one of the grave offences has to undergo penance (*mānāpya*, *mānatva*) in both communities for half a month. Ānanda, I promulgate this as the seventh *gurudharma*, which is not to be transgressed, so that women may restrain their faults. Women are to observe it for their whole lives.

[8. homage]

Ānanda, even if a nun has received full acceptance for a hundred years and a monk has just received the full acceptance, she should revere him, welcome him with her hands folded, and pay homage to him. Ānanda, I promulgate this as the eighth *gurudharma*, which is not to be transgressed, so that women may restrain their faults. Women are to observe it for their whole lives.

Ānanda, if Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī together with the five hundred Śākyan women uphold and apply themselves diligently to these eight, then this is their going forth, this is their full acceptance, this is their becoming nuns."<sup>38</sup>

Then the venerable Ānanda was much delighted at the words spoken by the Blessed One, honoured the feet of the Blessed One with his head, left,

and proceeded to the presence of Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī. Having arrived he said to Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī: “Gautamī, women have been given the going forth, the full acceptance, the [possibility of] becoming nuns. But, Gautamī, <sup>[P 100b]</sup> the Blessed One has established eight *gurudharmas* that are not to be transgressed, with the purpose of restricting the faults of women. For that reason women are to observe them for their whole lives and apply themselves diligently to them.”

[Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī said:] “Venerable Ānanda, may you report what [the Blessed One] has instructed.”

[Ānanda said:]

[1. going forth and full acceptance]

“Gautamī, thus is the instruction by the Blessed One: <sup>[D 103b]</sup> ‘Ānanda, women are to receive the going forth in the homeless life and receive the full acceptance into the monastic life, become nuns, from the monks.’ Gautamī, the Blessed One promulgated this as the first *gurudharma*, which is not to be transgressed, so that women may restrain their faults. Women are to observe it for their whole lives.’<sup>39</sup>

[2. exhortation]

Gautamī, the Blessed One further instructed: ‘Ānanda the nuns should request instruction in the presence of the monks every half month. Gautamī, the Blessed One promulgated this as the second *gurudharma*, which is not to be transgressed, so that women may restrain their faults. Women are to observe it for their whole lives.’

[3. rains residency]

Gautamī, the Blessed One further instructed: ‘Ānanda, a nun cannot enter the rains in a place where there are no monks. Gautamī, the Blessed One promulgated this as the third *gurudharma*, which is not to be transgressed, so that women may restrain their faults. Women are to observe it for their whole lives.’

[4. invitation]

Gautamī, the Blessed One further instructed: ‘Ānanda, a nun who has entered the rains has to undertake an invitation from both communities in three aspects, in regard to what has been seen, heard or suspected. Gautamī, the Blessed One promulgated this as the fourth *gurudharma*,

which is not to be transgressed, so that women may restrain their faults. Women are to observe it for their whole lives.’

[5. not to speak of a monk’s faults]

Gautamī, the Blessed One further said: ‘Ānanda, a nun who sees that there is a breach in relation to a monk’s morality, a breach in relation to a monk’s view, a breach in relation to a monk’s conduct, or a breach in relation to a monk’s livelihood, has to refrain from reporting it and reminding him of it. Ānanda, a monk who sees that there is a breach in relation to a nun’s morality, a breach in relation to a nun’s view, a breach in relation to a nun’s conduct or a breach in relation to a nun’s livelihood, is not prohibited from reporting it and reminding her of it. Gautamī, the Blessed One promulgated this as the fifth *gurudharma*, which is not to be transgressed, so that women may restrain their faults. Women are to observe it for their whole lives.’

[6. not to rebuke a monk]

Gautamī, the Blessed One further instructed: ‘Ānanda, a nun is not to rebuke, show anger towards, or threaten a monk. Ānanda, it is not allowed that a nun rebukes, shows anger towards, or threatens a monk. Gautamī, the Blessed One promulgated this as the sixth *gurudharma*, which is not to be transgressed, so that women may restrain their faults. Women are to observe it for their whole lives.’

[7. penance]

Gautamī, the Blessed One further instructed: ‘Ānanda, a nun who has transgressed against one of the grave offences has to undergo penance (*mānāpya, mānatva*) in both communities for half a month. Gautamī, the Blessed One promulgated this as the seventh *gurudharma*, which is not to be transgressed, so that women may restrain their faults. Women are to observe it for their whole lives.’

[8. homage]

Gautamī, the Blessed One further instructed: ‘Ānanda, even if a nun has received full acceptance for a hundred years and a monk has just received the full acceptance, she should revere him, welcome him with her hands folded, and pay homage to him. Gautamī, the Blessed One promulgated this as the eighth *gurudharma*, which is not to be transgressed, so that women may restrain their faults. Women are to observe it for their whole lives.’

The Blessed One further instructed: ‘Ānanda, if Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī upholds and applies herself diligently to these eight *gurudharmas*, then this is her going forth, this is her full acceptance, this is her becoming a nun’.”<sup>40</sup>

[Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī said:] “Venerable Ānanda, the Blessed One established these eight *gurudharmas* for the purpose of restraining faults of women, which women are to observe for their whole lives. I receive them in speech and mind and [place them] on my head. Venerable Ānanda, it is just as if there is a woman from a royal family or from a Brahmin family or from a *kṣatriya* family or also from a *vaiśya* family who has well bathed, well anointed herself, done up her hair and her nails and put on a clean white dress. Somebody gives her a lotus wreath, or a *vārṣika* wreath, or an *atimuktaka* wreath. Very joyfully she receives it with both hands and places it on her head. Venerable Ānanda, just in the same way the Blessed One has established these eight *gurudharmas* for the purpose of restraining the faults of women, which women are to observe for their whole lives, so I receive them in speech and mind and [place them] on my head.”

**Translation of the \*Mahāprajāpatī-gautamī-sūtra Quotation in the Abhidharmakośopāyikā-ṭīkā<sup>41</sup>**

“Through the undertaking of the eight *gurudharmas* [there is the full acceptance (*upasampadā*)] of Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī.”<sup>42</sup>

— Extracted from the Discourse to Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī [found] at the end of the Explanation of the exposition.<sup>43</sup>

“However, Ānanda, I ought to promulgate for the group of women eight *gurudharmas* that are to be protected and not to be transgressed, and that the group of women are to train in as long as life lasts.<sup>44</sup> [D 213a]

Ānanda, just as, for example, at the time of autumn, after the rainy season has passed, householder farmers construct dams by the riverbanks of a small river or the riverbanks of a large river, so that the water is held in check and cannot overflow at all. Ānanda, in the same way, I ought to promulgate for the group of women eight *gurudharmas* that are to be protected and not to be transgressed, [P 243a] that the group of women are to train in as long as life lasts. What are the eight?



[1. going forth and full acceptance]

“Ānanda, women are to receive the going forth and the full acceptance, the condition of becoming a nun, from the monks. Ānanda, this is the first *gurudharma* [promulgated] by me that the group of women are to protect and not to transgress, that the group of women are to train in as long as life lasts.<sup>45</sup>

[2. exhortation]

Ānanda, every half month a nun is to receive the delivery of an exhortation for nuns. This is the second *gurudharma* promulgated [by me] that the group of women are to protect and not to transgress, that the group of women are to train in as long as life lasts.<sup>46</sup>

[3. rains residency]

Ānanda, a nun is not to take up the rains residency in a dwelling where there are no monks. This is the third *gurudharma* promulgated [by me] that the group of women are to protect and not to transgress, that the group of women are to train in as long as life lasts.<sup>47</sup>

[4. invitation]

At the completion of the rainy season retreat, a nun is to undertake the invitation (*pravāraṇā*) in both communities in three respects, in regard to three things, [namely,] what has been seen, what has been heard or what has been remembered. Ānanda, this is the fourth *gurudharma* promulgated [by me] that the group of women are to protect and not to transgress, that the group of women are to train in as long as life lasts.<sup>48</sup>

[5. not to speak of a monk's faults]

Ānanda, a nun is to refrain from contending with a monk<sup>49</sup> and is to refrain from bringing attention to a breach of morality, a breach of view, <sup>[D 213b]</sup> a breach of conduct,<sup>50</sup> or a breach of livelihood. It is also prohibited for a nun to remind a monk <sup>[P 243b]</sup> of a breach of morality, a breach of view, a breach of conduct, or a breach of livelihood. It is not prohibited for a monk to remind a nun of<sup>51</sup> a breach of morality, a breach of view, a breach of conduct, or a breach of livelihood. Ānanda, this is the fifth *gurudharma* promulgated by me that the group of women are to protect and not to transgress, that the group of women are to train in as long as life lasts.<sup>52</sup>

[6. not to rebuke a monk]

Ānanda, a nun cannot speak angrily to a monk, a nun is forbidden to upbraid a monk. Ānanda, this is the sixth *gurudharma* promulgated by me that the group of women are to protect and not to transgress, that the group of women are to train in as long as life lasts.<sup>53</sup>

[7. penance]

Ānanda, a nun who has who has transgressed against one of the grave offences should undergo penance for half a month in both communities. Ānanda, this is the seventh *gurudharma* promulgated by me that the group of women are to protect and not to transgress, that the group of women are to train in as long as life lasts.<sup>54</sup>

[8. homage]

A nun who has received full acceptance for a hundred years should get up from her seat, bow down and pay homage to a monk who has received full acceptance on that day. Ānanda, this is the eighth *gurudharma* promulgated by me that the group of women are to protect and not to transgress, that the group of women are to train in as long as life lasts.<sup>55</sup>

Ānanda, if Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī undertakes these eight *gurudharmas*, then this will be her going forth and full acceptance, her becoming a nun.<sup>56</sup> [P 244a]

Then the venerable Ānanda much delighted in what the Blessed One had said, <sup>[D 214a]</sup> paid homage with his head to the feet of the Blessed One and left the presence of the Blessed One.

He approached Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī. After he had reached her, he told Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī: “Gautamī, women can obtain the going forth and full acceptance, the condition of becoming a nun, although the Blessed One promulgated for women eight *gurudharmas* that the group of women are to protect and not to transgress, that the group of women are to train in as long as life lasts. Listen to what will be explained.”<sup>57</sup>

### Appendix: Collated Edition of Up 4024

C, *mngon*, ju 212b6–214a3; D 4094, *mngon pa*, ju 212b6–214a3; G 3598, *mngon ’grel*, tu 319b1–321a4; N, *mngon*, tu 234a3–235b2; P 5595, *mngon pa’i bstan bcos*, tu 242b6–244a4; cf. also Si-T 3323 *mngon pa*, ju 519,6–522,5.

bla ma'i chos khas blangs pas ni skye <sup>[D 212b7; N 234a4]</sup> 'dgu'<sup>i</sup> bdag mo zhes bya ba la |  
 rnam grangs <sup>[C 212b7]</sup> rnam par bshad pa'i mthar skye <sup>[D 212b7]</sup> 'dgu'<sup>ii</sup>  
 bdag <sup>[G 319b2]</sup> 'mo'<sup>iii</sup> chen mo'i mdo las 'don te | kun dga' bo 'on kyang ngas  
 bud med kyi tshogs <sup>[P 242b7]</sup> yongs su bsrung ba dang | yongs su mi 'da' ba  
 dang | gang las bud med kyi tshogs ji srid 'tsho'i bar du slob par byed  
<sup>[N 234a5]</sup> par 'gyur ba bla ma'i chos <sup>[iv]</sup> rnam pa brgyad <sup>[D 213a1]</sup> bca' <sup>[C 213a1; G</sup>  
<sup>319b3]</sup> bar bya ste | kun dga' bo dper na | khyim bdag zhing pa dag dbyar <sup>[P</sup>  
<sup>242b8]</sup> 'das pa'i 'og tu <sup>[v]</sup> 'ston gyi dus na chu yongs su <sup>[vi]</sup> bsrungs shing yongs  
 su mi 'da' bar bya ba'i don du chu bo'i 'gram <sup>[vii]</sup> 'mam gtsang po'i <sup>[N 234a6]</sup>  
 'gram du chu <sup>[G 319b4]</sup> lon dag 'ching bar byed de | kun dga' bo <sup>[C 213a2]</sup> de <sup>[D</sup>  
<sup>213a2]</sup> bzhin du ngas bud med kyi tshogs <sup>[P 243a1]</sup> rnam s yongs su <sup>[viii]</sup> bsrung  
 ba dang <sup>[ix]</sup> yongs su mi 'da' ba dang | gang gis <sup>[x]</sup> 'bud med kyi tshogs rnam  
 ji <sup>[xi]</sup> 'srid 'tsho'i bar du slob par <sup>[xii]</sup> 'byed par 'gyur <sup>[G 319b5]</sup> ba bla ma'i chos  
<sup>[N 234a7]</sup> rnam pa brgyad bca' bar bya ste <sup>[P 243a2]</sup> brgyad gang zhe na | kun  
 dga' bo bud med kyi tshogs dag <sup>[C 213a3; D 213a3]</sup> gis <sup>[xiii]</sup> rab tu byung zhing  
 bsnyen par rdzogs pa dge slong ma'i dngos <sup>[xiv]</sup> 'po dge slong dag las blang  
 bar bya ste | kun dga' bo <sup>[v]</sup> 'di ngas ni bud med kyi tshogs yongs  
 su <sup>[N 234b1]</sup> bsrung <sup>[P 243a3]</sup> ba dang yongs su mi 'da' bar bya ba dang | gang  
 las bud med kyi tshogs ji srid 'tsho'i bar du slob par byed par 'gyur <sup>[D</sup>  
<sup>213a4]</sup> ba bla ma'i <sup>[C 213a4]</sup> chos dang po'o || kun dga' bo dge slong mas <sup>[Si-T 520]</sup>  
 dge slong ma dag zla ba phyed phyed <sup>[xv]</sup> 'cing <sup>[G 320a1]</sup> gdams <sup>[P 243a4]</sup> ngag  
 dang rjes su bstan pas blang <sup>[N 234b2]</sup> bar bya ste | 'di ni bud med kyi tshogs  
 yongs su bsrung zhing yongs su mi 'da' ba dang | gang las bud med kyi  
 tshogs ji srid 'tsho'i bar du slob par <sup>[D 213a5]</sup> byed par 'gyur ba bla ma'i <sup>[G</sup>  
<sup>320a2]</sup> chos <sup>[C 213a5]</sup> bcas pa <sup>[P 243a5]</sup> gnyis pa'o || kun dga' bo dge slong med  
 pa'i gnas su <sup>[N 234b3]</sup> dge slong ma dbyar gnas pa'i phyir 'gro bar mi bya  
 ste | 'di ni bud med kyi tshogs yongs su bsrung ba dang | yongs su mi 'da'  
 ba dang | gang las bud med kyi <sup>[G 320a3]</sup> tshogs ji <sup>[P 243a6]</sup> srid <sup>[D 213a6]</sup> 'tsho'i  
 bar du slob par byed <sup>[C 213a6]</sup> par 'gyur ba bla ma'i chos bcas pa gsum pa'o  
 || dbyar <sup>[N 234b4]</sup> gnas pa'i 'og tu dge slong mas mthong ba dang thos pa  
 dang <sup>[xvi]</sup> dran pa'i gnas <sup>[xvii]</sup> rnam pa gsum <sup>[xviii]</sup> 'gyis <sup>[xix]</sup> 'gnyi ga' <sup>[G 320a4]</sup> dge  
 'dun la dgag <sup>[P 243a7]</sup> dbye bya ba ste | kun dga' bo ngas 'di ni bud med kyi  
 tshogs <sup>[D 213a7]</sup> yongs su bsrung zhing | yongs su <sup>[C 213a7]</sup> mi 'da' ba dang |  
 gang <sup>[N 234b5]</sup> las bud med kyi tshogs ji srid 'tsho'i bar du slob par byed  
 par 'gyur ba bla ma'i chos <sup>[G 320a5]</sup> bcas pa <sup>[P 243a8]</sup> bzhi pa'o || kun dga' bo  
 dge slong mas dge slong la rtsod par mi bya ba dang | tshul khrims kyi  
 skyon dang | Ita ba'i skyon dang | <sup>[D 213b1]</sup> 'dpyod <sup>[xx]</sup> pa'i skyon dang <sup>[xxi]</sup> 'tsho  
<sup>[C 213b1]</sup> ba'i skyon <sup>[N 234b6]</sup> dran par mi bya ba dang | dge slong mas dge <sup>[G</sup>  
<sup>320a6]</sup> slong <sup>[xxii]</sup> 'la <sup>[P 243b1]</sup> rtsod pa dang <sup>[xxiii]</sup> tshul khrims kyi skyon dang <sup>[xxiv]</sup>  
 Ita ba'i skyon dang | 'dpyod <sup>[xxv]</sup> pa'i skyon dang | 'tsho ba'i skyon dran par  
 byed pa ni dgag par <sup>[xxvi]</sup> 'bya ba dag go || dge slong gis dge slong ma <sup>[xxvii]</sup>

rtsod pa dang<sup>[xxviii]</sup> tshul khrims kyi<sup>{D 213b2}</sup> skyon<sup>{N 234b7}</sup> dang<sup>{G 320b1}</sup> lta ba'i  
 skyon<sup>{C 213b2}</sup> dang dpyod pa'i skyon dang<sup>{P 243b2}</sup> 'tsho ba'i skyon dran par  
 'mi<sup>[xxix]</sup> byed pa ni dgag pa ma yin no || kun dga' bo 'di ni ngas bud med kyi  
 tshogs yongs su bsrung zhing yongs su mi 'da' ba dang gang las bud med  
 kyi 'tshogs ji<sup>[xxx]</sup> srid 'tsho'i bar du<sup>[xxxi]</sup> {N 235a1} slob par byed<sup>{G 320b2}</sup> par<sup>{P 243b3}</sup>  
 'gyur ba bla ma'i<sup>{C 213b3}</sup> chos bcas<sup>{D 213b3}</sup> pa<sup>{Si-T 521}</sup> lnga pa'o || kun  
 dga' bo dge slong la dge slong mas khro bar mi bya zhing smra bar mi bya  
 ste | dge slong la dge slong mas rtsod cing khro la smra bar byed pa bkag  
 pa ste | kun dga'<sup>{N 235a2}</sup> bo 'di ni ngas bud med<sup>{G 320b3}</sup> kyi<sup>{P 243b4}</sup> tshogs  
 yongs su bsrung zhing yongs su mi 'da' bar bya ba dang | gang las<sup>{C 213b4}</sup>  
 bud<sup>{D 213b4}</sup> med kyi tshogs ji srid 'tsho'i bar du slob par byed par 'gyur  
 ba bla ma'i chos bcas pa drug pa'o || kun dga' bo dge slong ma bla ma'i  
 chos<sup>{N 235a3}</sup> {P 243b5} [las<sup>[xxxii]</sup> 'das<sup>{G 320b4}</sup> nas zla ba phyed du gnyi ga'i dge  
 'dun mgu 'ba<sup>[xxxiii]</sup> spyad par bya ba ste | kun dga' bo 'di ni ngas bud med  
 kyi tshogs yongs su 'bsrung<sup>[xxxiv]</sup> zhing<sup>{C 213b5}</sup> {D 213b5} yongs su mi 'da' bar  
 bya ba dag las gang bud med kyi tshogs ji srid 'tsho'i<sup>{P 243b6}</sup> bar du slob  
 par byed par 'gyur<sup>{N 235a4}</sup> ba bla<sup>{G 320b5}</sup> ma'i chos bcas pa bdun pa'o || dge  
 slong ma lo brgya lon pas kyang de ring bsnyen par rdzogs pa'i dge slong  
 la mngon par brjod cing phyag 'tshal ba dang | stan las<sup>{D 213b6}</sup> ldang<sup>{C 213b6}</sup>  
 ba dang | 'dud pa'i<sup>{P 243b7}</sup> las dag bya ba ste | kun<sup>{G 320b6}</sup> dga' bo 'di  
 ni ngas bud<sup>{N 235a5}</sup> med kyi tshogs yongs su bsrung zhing yongs su mi  
 'da' ba dang | gang las bud med kyi tshogs ji srid 'tsho'i bar du slob par  
 byed par 'gyur ba bla ma'i chos bcas<sup>{P 243b8}</sup> pa brgyad pa'o || kun dga'<sup>{G 321a1}</sup>  
 bo skye<sup>{D 213b7}</sup> dgu'i bdag<sup>{C 213b7}</sup> mo chen mo gau ta 'mi<sup>[xxxv]</sup> gal te<sup>{N 235a6}</sup>  
 bla mar gyur pa'i chos brgyad po 'di dag yang dag par 'bsgrubs<sup>[xxxvi]</sup>  
 na de nyid kyis rab tu byung zhing bsnyen par rdzogs nas dge slong ma'i  
 dngos por<sup>{P 244a1}</sup> 'gyur ro || de nas tshe dang ldan pa kun<sup>{G 321a2}</sup> dga' bo  
 bcom ldan 'das kyis gsungs pa la mngon par<sup>{N 235a7}</sup> dga'<sup>{D 214a1}</sup> zhing<sup>{C 214a1}</sup>  
 rjes su yi rang nas bcom ldan 'das kyi zhabs la spyi bos phyag byas  
 te | bcom ldan 'das kyi drung 'nas<sup>[xxxvii]</sup> {P 244a2} song ste | skye dgu'i bdag mo  
 gau ta 'mi<sup>[xxxviii]</sup> gang na 'ba<sup>[xxxix]</sup> der song ste nye bar song nas<sup>{G 321a3}</sup> skye  
 dgu'i bdag mo chen mo gau ta 'mi<sup>[xl]</sup> la 'di<sup>{N 235b1}</sup> skad<sup>{Si-T 522}</sup> ces smras so  
 ||<sup>{C 214a2; D 214a2}</sup> gau ta 'mi<sup>[xli]</sup> bud med kyi tshogs 'kyis<sup>[xlii]</sup> rab tu byung zhing  
 bsnyen par rdzogs te dge slong ma'i dngos po rnyed mod<sup>{P 244a3}</sup> kyi 'on  
 kyang bcom ldan 'das kyis bud med kyi tshogs yongs su<sup>{G 321a4}</sup> 'bsrung<sup>[xliii]</sup>  
 zhing yongs su mi 'da' bar bya ba dang | gang las bud med kyi tshogs  
 ji srid<sup>{N 235b2}</sup> 'tsho'i bar du slob par 'gyur<sup>{C 214a3}</sup> ba<sup>{D 214a3}</sup> bla ma'i chos  
 brgyad bcas pa de nyon cig dang bshad<sup>{P 244a4}</sup> par bya'o zhes gsungs so ||

## Notes to the Collated Edition of Up 4024

- i. CD: dgu'i. GNP: dgu.  
 ii. CD: dgu'i. GNP: dgu.  
 iii. G: ma.  
 iv. G: ma.  
 v. C: sdon.  
 vi. CDP: bsrungs. G: mi 'da' bsrung. N: bsrung.  
 vii. CD: mam. GNP: 'am  
 viii. G: bsrungs.  
 ix. GNP add: |.  
 x. G: bued.  
 xi. P: sid.  
 xii. P: byad.  
 xiii. CD: gis. GNP: gi.  
 xiv. G: po.  
 xv. CD: cing. GNP: zhing.  
 xvi. GNP add: |.  
 xvii. D: gdas.  
 xviii. G: gyi.  
 xix. CD: gnyi ga'i. GNP: gnyis ka'i.  
 xx. CD: dpyod. GNP: spyod. For the preferred reading see note 50 to the translation.  
 xxi. GNP add: |.  
 xxii. CD: la. GN: ma. For the preferred reading see note 49 to the translation.  
 xxiii. GNP omit: |.  
 xxiv. GNP add: |.  
 xxv. CD: dpyod. GNP: spyod. For the preferred reading see note 50 to the translation.  
 xxvi. G omit: bya ba.  
 xxvii. G omit: la. For the preferred reading see note 51 to the translation.  
 xxviii. GNP add: |.  
 xxix. CD add: mi. GNP omit: mi. For the preferred reading see note 51 to the translation.  
 xxx. G omit: tshogs ji.  
 xxxi. P add: |.  
 xxxii. CD: las. GNP: la.  
 xxxiii. CD: ba. GNP: bar.  
 xxxiv. G: srung.  
 xxxv. CD: mī. GNP: ma.  
 xxxvi. CD: bsgrubs. GNP: sgrub.  
 xxxvii. CD: nas. GNP: na.  
 xxxviii. D: mī. C: mi. GNP: ma.  
 xxxix. G: ba.  
 xl. CD: mī. GNP: ma.  
 xli. CD: mī. GNP: ma.  
 xlii. CD: kyis. GNP: kyi.  
 xliii. G: srung.

## Abbreviations

Bv	<i>Buddhavaṃsa</i>
C	Cone edition
CBETA	Chinese Buddhist Electronic Text Association
D	Derge edition (Tōhoku)
G	Golden Tanjur edition
MĀ	<i>Madhyama-āgama</i> (T 26)
MN	<i>Majjhima-nikāya</i>
N	Narhang edition
P	Peking edition (Ōtani)
Si-K	dpe bsdur ma (‘Sichuan’) Kanjur
Si-T	dpe bsdur ma (‘Sichuan’) Tanjur
T	Taishō edition (CBETA, 2014)
Up	<i>Abhidharmakośopāyikā-ṭīkā</i>
Vin	Theravāda <i>Vinaya</i>

## References

- Anālayo, Bhikkhu 2011: “Mahāpajāpati’s Going Forth in the Madhyama-āgama”, *Journal of Buddhist Ethics*, 18: 268–317 [reprinted in id. 2012: *Madhyama-āgama Studies* (Dharma Drum Buddhist College Research Series, 5), Taipei: Dharma Drum Publishing Corporation, 449–488].
- Anālayo, Bhikkhu 2013a: “The Revival of the Bhikkhunī Order and the Decline of the Sāsana”, *Journal of Buddhist Ethics*, 20: 110–193.
- Anālayo, Bhikkhu 2013b: “The Legality of Bhikkhunī Ordination”, *Journal of Buddhist Ethics (Special 20th Anniversary Issue)*, Damien Keown and Charles Prebish (ed.), 20: 310–333.
- Anālayo, Bhikkhu 2014: “On the Bhikkhunī Ordination Controversy”, *Sri Lanka International Journal of Buddhist Studies*, 3: 1–20.
- Anālayo, Bhikkhu 2016a: *The Foundation History of the Nuns’ Order* (Hamburg Buddhist Studies, 6), Bochum and Freiburg: Projekt Verlag.
- Anālayo, Bhikkhu 2016b: “The Going Forth of Mahāpajāpati Gotamī in T 60”, *Journal of Buddhist Ethics*, 23: 1–31 [reprinted in id. 2017: *Vinaya Studies* (Dharma Drum Institute of Liberal Arts Research Series, 7), Taipei: Dharma Drum Publishing Corporation (forthcoming)].
- Anālayo, Bhikkhu 2017: “The ‘School Affiliation’ of the Madhyama-āgama”, in *Research on the Madhyama-āgama*, Dhammadinnā (ed.) (Dharma Drum Institute of Liberal Arts Research Series, 5), Taipei: Dharma Drum Publishing Corporation (forthcoming).
- Anālayo, Bhikkhu: “Bhikṣuṇī Ordination”, in *Oxford Handbook of Buddhist Ethics*, Daniel Cozort and James Mark Shields (ed.), Oxford: Oxford University Press, forthcoming.

- Bechert, Heinz et al. 2003: *Sanskrit-Wörterbuch der buddhistischen Texte aus den Turfan-Funden und der kanonischen Literatur der Sarvāstivāda-Schule* (Aufträge der Akademie der Wissenschaften zu Göttingen), vol. 2: *k / dh*, Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht.
- Borgland, Jens Wilhelm 2014: *A Study of the Adhikaraṇavastu, Legal Settlement Procedures of the Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya*, doctoral dissertation, Department of Culture Studies and Oriental Languages, Faculty of Humanities, University of Oslo.
- Chiu, Tzu-Lung and Ann Heirman 2014: “The Gurudharmas in Buddhist Nunneries of Mainland China”, *Buddhist Studies Review*, 31.2: 241–272.
- Chung, Jin-il 1997: “Two karmavācanā Texts of the Mūlasarvāstivādins: Cīvarādhiṣṭāna and Pātrādhiṣṭāna”, in *Bauddhavidyāsudhākaraḥ, Studies in Honour of Heinz Bechert on the Occasion of His 65th Birthday*, Petra Kieffer-Pülz and Jens-Uwe Hartmann (ed.) (Indica et Tibetica, 30), Indica et Tibetica Verlag: Swisttal-Odendorf 1997, 39–54.
- Chung, Jin-il 1998: “‘Bhikṣuṇī-karmavācanā’ of the Mūlasarvāstivādins”, in *Facets of Indian Culture, Gustav Roth Felicitation Volume, Published on the Occasion of his 82nd Birthday*, C.P. Sinha (ed.), India, Patna: Bihar Puravid Parishad, 420–423.
- Chung, Jin-il 1999: “Gurudharma und Aṣṭau Gurudharmāḥ”, *Indo-Iranian Journal*, 42: 227–234.
- Clarke, Shayne 2001: “The Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya Mukṭaka 根本說一切有部目得迦”, *Buddhist Studies / Bukkyō kenkyū* 佛教研究, 30: 8–107.
- Clarke, Shayne 2014a: *Family Matters in Indian Buddhist Monasticisms*, Honolulu: University of Hawai’i Press.
- Clarke, Shayne 2014b: *Vinaya Texts* (Gilgit Manuscripts in the National Archives of India Facsimile Edition, 1), New Delhi and Tokyo: The National Archives of India and The International Research Institute for Advanced Buddhism at Soka University.
- Clarke, Shayne 2015: “Vinayas”, in *Brill’s Encyclopedia of Buddhism*, vol. 1: *Literature and Languages*, Jonathan A. Silk, Oskar von Hinüber and Vincent Eltschinger (ed.), Leiden: Brill, 60–87.
- Dhammadinnā, Sāmaṇerī 2012: “A Translation of the Quotations in Śamathadeva’s Abhidharmakośopāyikā-ṭīkā Parallel to the Chinese Saṃyukta-āgama Discourses 8, 9, 11, 12, 17 and 28”, *Dharma Drum Journal of Buddhist Studies / Fagu foxue xuebao* 法鼓佛學學報, 11: 63–95.
- Dhammadinnā, Bhikkhunī 2015a: “The Parinirvāṇa of Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī and Her Followers in the Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya”, *Indian International Journal of Buddhist Studies*, 16: 29–61.
- Dhammadinnā, Bhikkhunī 2015b: “Women’s Predictions to Buddhahood in Middle-Period Literature”, *Journal of Buddhist Ethics*, 22: 481–531.
- Dhammadinnā, Bhikkhunī 2016a: “The Funeral of Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī and Her followers in the Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya”, *Indian International Journal of Buddhist Studies*, 17: 25–74.
- Dhammadinnā, Bhikkhunī 2016b: “From a Liberated One to a Liberated One: An Avadāna Quotation in the Abhidharmakośopāyikā-ṭīkā”,



- Dharma Drum Journal of Buddhist Studies / Fagu foxue xuebao* 法鼓佛學學報, 19 (forthcoming).
- Dhammadinnā, Bhikkhunī: *The Madhyama-āgama in Śamathadeva's Abhidharmakośopāyikā-ṭīkā* (Dharma Drum Institute of Liberal Arts Research Series), Taipei: Dharma Drum Publishing Corporation (in preparation).
- Honjō Yoshifumi, Bhikkhunī Dhammadinnā and Bhikkhu Anālayo: “The School Affiliation of the Abhidharmakośopāyika-ṭīkā” (in preparation).
- Emms, Christopher 2012: *Evidence for Two Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya Traditions in the Gilgit Prātimokṣa-sūtras*, MA thesis, McMaster University.
- Finnegan, Damchö Diana 2009: ‘For the Sake of Women too’, *Ethics and Gender in the Narratives of the Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya*, PhD thesis, University of Wisconsin-Madison.
- Honjō, Yoshifumi 1984: *A Table of Āgama Citations in the Abhidharmakośa and the Abhidharmakośopāyikā*, Kyoto (privately published).
- Honjō Yoshifumi (本庄 良文) 1987: “Shamathadēva no tsutaeru ritten シヤマタデーヴァの伝へる律典 (A Vinaya Text as Quoted by Samathadeva)”, *Buddhist Studies / Bukkyō Kenkyū* 仏教研究, 16: 123–134.
- Honjō, Yoshifumi (本庄 良文) 2014: *Kusharon chū Upāyikā no kenkyū* 俱舍論註ウパーイカーの研究, Tokyo: Daizō-shuppan, 2 vols.
- Kishino (IV), Ryoji (sic) 2013: *A Study of the Nidāna, An Underrated Canonical Text of the Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya*, PhD thesis, University of California, Los Angeles.
- Krey, Gisela 2010: “Some Remarks on the Status of Bhikṣuṇīs and Laywomen in Early Buddhism”, in *Dignity and Discipline, The Evolving Role of Women in Buddhism*, Thea Möhr and Jampa Tsedroen (ed.), Boston: Wisdom, 39–63.
- de la Vallée Poussin, Louis 1980: *L’Abhidharmakośa de Vasubandhu, traduction et annotations*, vol. 3: *Chapitre 4* (Mélanges chinois et bouddhiques, 16), Bruxelles: Institut belge des Hautes Études chinoises.
- Lamotte, Étienne 1944: *Le Traité de la Grande vertu de sagesse de Nāgārjuna (Mahāprajñāpāramitāśāstra)*, vol. 1: *Chapitres I-XV* (Bibliothèque du Muséon, 18), Louvain-la-Neuve: Institut Orientaliste.
- Lamotte, Étienne 1970: *Le Traité de la Grande vertu de sagesse de Nāgārjuna (Mahāparajñāpāramitāśāstra)*, avec une nouvelle Introduction, vol. 3: *Chapitres XXXI-XXLII* (Publications de l’Institut Orientaliste de Louvain), Louvain: Université de Louvain, Institut Orientaliste.
- Li, Yu-chen (李玉珍) 2008: “The Gender Issue in Contemporary Taiwan Buddhism”, in *Buddhist Women in a Global Multicultural Community*, Bhikṣuṇī Karma Lekshe Tsomo (ed.), *Buddhist Women in a Global Multicultural Community*, Petaling Jaya: Sukhi Hotu Dhamma Publications, 189–199.
- Martini, Giuliana 2012: “The Story of Sudinna in the Tibetan Translation of the Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya”, *Journal of Buddhist Ethics*, 19: 437–450.



- Nolot, Édith 1991: *Règles de discipline des nonnes bouddhistes, le Bhikṣuṇīvinaya de l'école Mahāsāṃghika-Lokottaravādin* (Publications de l'Institut de civilisation indienne, 60), Paris: Diffusion de Boccard.
- Paul, Diana Y. 1985: *Women in Buddhism, Images of the Feminine in the Mahāyāna Tradition*, 2nd edition, Berkeley: University of California Press (first edition 1979).
- Pradhan, P. 1967: *Abhidharma Kośabhāṣya of Vasubandhu*, Patna: K.P. Jayaswal Research Institute.
- Ridding C.M. and L. de la Vallée Poussin 1920: "A Fragment of the Sanskrit Vinaya, Bhikṣunikarmavacana [sic]", *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies*, 1: 123–143.
- Rockhill, W. Woodville 1884: *The Life of the Buddha and the Early History of His Order, derived from Tibetan Works in the Bkah-gyur and Bstan-gyur, Followed by Notices on the Early History of Tibet and Khoten*, London: Trübner & Co.
- Roth, Gustav 1970: *Bhikṣuṇī-Vinaya, Including Bhikṣuṇī-Prakīrṇaka and a Summary of the Bhikṣu-Prakīrṇaka of the Ārya-Mahāsāṃghika-Lokottaravādin, Edited and Annotated for the First Time with Introduction and Two Indexes* (Tibetan Sanskrit Works Series, 12), Patna: K.P. Jayaswal Research Institute.
- Schmidt, Michael 1993: "Bhikṣuṇī-karmavācanā, Die Handschrift Sansk. c.25(R) der Bodleian Library Oxford", in *Studien zur Indologie und Buddhismuskunde*, Reinhold Grünendahl, Jens-Uwe Hartmann, Petra Kieffer-Pülz (ed.) (Indica et Tibetica, 22), Bonn: Indica et Tibetica Verlag, 239–288.
- Schmidt, Michael 1994: "Zur Schulzugehörigkeit einer nepalesischen Handschrift der Bhikṣuṇī-Karmavācanā", in *Untersuchungen zur Buddhistischen Literatur* (Sanskrit-Wörterbuch der buddhistischen Texte aus den Turfan-Funden, Beiheft 5), Heinz Bechert (ed.), Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 155–164.
- Silk, Jonathan A. 2008: *Managing Monks, Administrators and Administrative Roles in Indian Buddhist Monasticism* (South Asia Research), Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Skilling, Peter 2000: "Nonnen, Laienanhängerinnen, Spenderinnen, Göttinnen: Weibliche Rollen im Frühen Indischen Buddhismus", in *Aspekte des Weiblichen in der indischen Kultur* (Indica et Tibetica, 31), Ulriche Roesler (ed.), Swisstal-Odendorf: Indica et Tibetica, 47–102.
- Strong, John 1995: *The Experience of Buddhism, Sources and Interpretations*, Belmont, California: Wadsworth Publishing Company.
- Tsedroen Jampa, Bhikṣuṇī and Bhikkhu Anālayo 2013: "The gurudharma on bhikṣuṇī Ordination in the Mūlasarvāstivāda Tradition", *Journal of Buddhist Ethics*, 20: 743–774.
- von Simson, Georg 1965: *Zur Diktion einiger Lehrtexte des buddhistischen Sanskritkanons* (Münchener Studien zur Sprachwissenschaft, Beiheft), München: J. Kitzinger.
- Wogihara, Unrai 1971: *Sphuṭārthā Abhidharmakośavyākhyā by Yaśomitra*, Tokyo: Sankibo Buddhist Book Store (or. publ.: Tokyo: The Publishing Association of the Abhidharmakośavyākhyā, 2 vols.,

- 1932–1936).
- Yao, Fumi (八尾史) 2013: “A Brief Note on the Newly Found Sanskrit Fragments of the Bhaiṣajyavastu of the Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya”, *Journal of Indian and Buddhist Studies / Indogaku bukkyōgaku kenkyū* 印度学仏教学研究, 61.3: 1130–1135 [72–77].
- Yao, Fumi 2015a: “The Story of Dharmadinnā: Ordination by Messenger in the Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya”, *Indo-Iranian Journal*, 58.3: 216–253.
- Yao, Fumi 2015b: “A Preliminary Report on the Newly Found Sanskrit Manuscript Fragments of the Bhaiṣajyavastu of the Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya”, *Indian Logic / インド論理学研究 (In Honour of Professor Matsuda Kazunobu on His Sixtieth Birthday)*, 8: 289–304.
- Yuyama, Akira 1979: *Vinaya-Texte* (Systematische Übersicht über die buddhistische Sanskrit-Literatur, 1), Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner.

**Acknowledgement:**

I thank Bhikkhu Anālayo, Bhikkhu Ariyadhammika and Petra Kieffer-Pülz for comments and suggestions.

## Notes

1. I translated and studied another episode in the life of Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī in the *Kṣudrakavastu* of the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya*, her *parinirvāṇa* attained in the company of her five hundred nun companions, in Dhammadinnā 2015a and 2016a.
2. Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya* in T 1451 at T XXIV 405a3: 又復我聞過去諸佛皆有四眾 and D 6, *ḍul ba, da* 307a1 (= P 1035, *ḍul ba, ne* 290a8): *gzhan yang sngon gyi dus na yang dag par rdzogs pa'i sangs rgyas rnam la 'khor bzhi yod pa de*; Sarvāstivāda *Vinaya*, T 1435 at T XXIII 449c10–11: 但以過去諸佛皆有四眾。 Cf. also the *\*Mahāprajāñāpāramitopadeśa* (大智度論), T 1509 at TXXV 68a17–18, translated in Lamotte 1944: I.95. On the possible reflection of this notion in Mūlasarvāstivāda *avadāna* materials see Dhammadinnā 2015b: 490–492; how the various traditions diverge on this point is discussed in Anālayo 2016a: 51 and 166.
3. Bv 2.8, noted by Skilling 2000: 56; cf. also Anālayo 2016a: 51 note 38.
4. The canonical accounts transmitted by the early Buddhist traditions gradually came to build the ideological platform for the identity of a fully-fledged monastic institution, as discussed in detail by Anālayo 2016a. For a comparative overview of the list of the eight *gurudharmas* see the survey in Chung 1999, and for the *gurudharmas* in the frame of the foundation history of the nuns' order see chapters 4 and 5 in Anālayo 2016a: 91–146 (including references to earlier literature) and id. 183–234 for translations of the parallel versions.
5. Among Sarvāstivāda and Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya* canonical and commentarial sources, which are the focus of this article, see, e.g., the Sarvāstivāda *Vinaya* (十誦律), T 1435 at T XXIII 410a10–11: 摩訶波闍波提比丘尼受八重法即得具足戒; Sarvāstivāda *\*Vinayavibhāṣā* (薩婆多毘尼毘婆沙), T 1440 at T XXIII 511a28: 六者八法受戒; *\*Vinayamātrkā* (毘尼母經), T 1463 at T XXIV 801b18: 又受八齋法亦名受具; Sarvāstivāda *\*Vinayamātrkā* (薩婆多部毘尼摩得勒伽), T 1441 at T XXIII 594a20–21: 五、自誓得, 謂摩訶迦葉及三說; Mūlasarvāstivāda *\*Vinayakārikā* (根本說一切有部毘奈耶頌), T 1459 at T XXIV 618b19–20: 又因喬答彌, 大世主請佛; 為說八敬法, 斯名得近圓 and D 4123, *ḍul ba, shu* 4a3–4 (= P 5625, *mdo 'grel ('ḍul ba), hu* 4a7–5a1): *gau ta ma lci chos kyiis de las gzhan ni ci rigs par las ni sngon 'gro bya ba ste*; Mūlasarvāstivāda *\*Vinayaśaṅgraha* (根本薩婆多部律攝), T 1458 at T XXIV 599a7–8 (七者受敬法, 謂大世主) and D 4105, *ḍul ba, nu* 242b6–7 (= P 5606, *mdo 'grel ('ḍul ba), phu* 316b1–4): *lci ba'i chos khas blangs pa rnam kyī ni skye dgu'i bdag mo chen mo gau ta mi'o*; *Mātrkā* in the *Uttaragrantha* of the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya*, D 7, *ḍul ba, pa* 235a3 (= P 1036, *ḍul ba, pe* 226a5): *bla mā'i chos khas blangs pa dang*. For Abhidharma works see *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*, Pradhan 1956: 212,6 on *Abhidharmakośa* IV.26: *gurudharmābhyupagameṇa mahāprajāpatyāḥ*, Chinese translation in T 1558 (Paramārtha) at T XXIX 74bc1–2: 六由敬受八尊重法調。大生主 and T 1559 (Xuanzang (玄奘)) at T 231c24–25: 如須陀夷。六由信受八尊法得大戒。如大瞿耽彌, and Tibetan translation in D 4090, *mngon pa, ku* 180b3–4 (= P 5591, *mdo 'grel (mngon pa), gu* 208a3–6): *bla mā'i chos khas blangs pas ni skye dgu'i bdag mo chen mo'o*; Miśrakāś *\*Abhidharmahṛdaya* (雜阿毘曇心論), T 1552 at T XXVIII 890c26–27: 謂摩訶迦葉問樂者謂須陀耶受重法; *\*Nyāyānusārin* (阿毘達磨順正理論) T 1562 at T XXIX 551b7: 六由敬受八尊重法調大生主。 On these listings in general cf. Yao 2015a: 234–237, with references to Japanese literature.
6. D 6, *ḍul ba, da* 104b5ult (= P 1035, *ḍul ba, ne* 101b6ult) and T 1451 at T XXIV 351c1ult.
7. Schmidt 1993: 248,6ult (preceded by a lacuna in the text); on this text see below within this introduction. As regards the parallel in the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Abhidharmakośopāyikā-ṭīkā* I translate in this article, it does not include the aftermath of the proclamation of the *gurudharmas*, nor does the parallel *Madhyama-āgama* discourse version, MĀ 116 at T I 605a10 to 607b16, a version stemming with considerable probability from a Sarvāstivāda textual lineage.
8. On group narrative in the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya* see the remarks in Dhammadinnā 2015a: 40–42.
9. Vin II 253,25: *sambahulāhi sākiyāñhi saddhīm*.

10. Sanskrit text in Roth 1970: 2–21 (§§1–18) (followed by a more detailed legal treatment of the *gurudharmas* on pp. 22–72), translated into French by Nolot 1991: 2–12 and English by Anālayo 2016a: 191–201 (a free English rendering is given in Strong 1995: 52–56).
11. Roth 1970: XXIX–XXX.
12. Theravāda *Vinaya* at Vin II 253,1ult; Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya* in T 1451 at T XXIV 350b10ult and D 6, *ḍul ba, da* 100a4ult (= P 1035, *ḍul ba, ne* 97a7ult); Dharmaguptaka *Vinaya* in T 1428 at T XXII 922c7ult. For a structural overview of the *Vinayas* see Clarke 2015 (esp. 66–67).
13. This is *garudhamma* 6 in the Theravāda *Vinaya*, which allows *bhikkhus* to ordain *bhikkhunīs* when a *bhikkhuni-saṅgha* is not yet (or no longer) in existence; see Anālayo 2013a, 2013b and 2014.
14. A reflection along the same lines is made in Anālayo forthcoming.
15. Chiu and Heirman 2014: 246.
16. Tsedroen and Anālayo 2013.
17. Full references in note 31 below; for a summary see Rockhill 1884: 60–62 and Finnegan 2009: 311–316 (the latter including translated excerpts).
18. T 1541 at T XXIV 305b10–351c2, translated in Anālayo 2016a: 208–216.
19. This is quotation Up 4024 (full references in the collated edition given as an appendix to this article); cf. Honjō 1984: 56–57. According to the numbering convention in Honjō 1984, the abbreviation Up stands for *Upāyikā* and the number 4024 for canonical quotation no. 24 in the fourth chapter of the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya* and of the *Abhidharmakośopāyikā-tīkā*. For an overview of the *Abhidharmakośopāyikā-tīkā* and its significance for the study of early Buddhist philology, including a survey of previous literature, see the introductions in Dhammadinnā 2012 and Honjō 2014 (in Japanese).
20. On the relationship between the *Abhidharmakośopāyikā-tīkā* and the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya* see Honjō 1987, Clarke 2001: 88–89, Martini 2012: 63 note 45, Dhammadinnā 2012: 68, Honjō 2014: I.36 and Clarke 2015: 76.
21. For the Tibetan title and references to the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya* passage see notes 42 and 43 below. Another brief citation from a *sūtra* bearing the same title as Up 4024 (Up 4108) as well as a long but untitled quotation (Up 4103) both correspond to the \**Gautamī-sūtra* of the *Madhyama-āgama* (MĀ 180), a parallel to the *Dhakkhināvibhaṅga-sutta* of the *Majjhima-nikāya* (MN 142); on these quotations see Dhammadinnā in preparation.
22. On the school affiliation of the *Abhidharmakośopāyikā-tīkā* see Dhammadinnā 2012: 68–70 (with references to earlier literature) and Honjō, Dhammadinnā and Anālayo in preparation.
23. Up 4024 has been translated into Japanese by Honjō 2014: II.535–537.
24. MĀ 116, T 26 at T I 605a10–607b6, translated into English by Anālayo 2011: 272–287 and 2016a: 217–227. On the school affiliation of the *Madhyama-āgama* extant in Chinese translation see Anālayo 2017.
25. *Abhidharmakośavyākhyā*, Wogihara 1971: 374,18–25, has a full quotation of the *gurudharmas*: *gurudharmābhyupagameneti aṣṭau gurudharmāḥ*: (1) *bhikṣor antikād bhikṣuṇīnām upasampat bhikṣuṇībhāvaḥ*; (2) *anvardhamāsam avavādo grāhyo bhikṣor antikāḥ*; (3) *abhikṣuke āvāse varṣā nopagantavyā*; (4) *pravāraṇāyām ubhayasaṃghas tribhīḥ sthānāḥ pravārayitavyaḥ*; (5) *na codayitavyo bhikṣur āpatim āpannāḥ nāroṣṭavyaḥ*; (6) *gurudharmāpattau mānāpyam ardhamaṣaṃ caritavyam*; (7) *varṣaśatopasaṃpannayāpy bhikṣuṇyā tatṣaṇopasaṃpanno bhikṣur vandyah*; (8) *na ca bhikṣuṇyā kvacid bhikṣus codayitavyaḥ – ity evam ādayaḥ. eṣām abhyupagameṇa, tasyā upasampat*. Tibetan in D 4092, *mgon pa, ngu* 28a4–7 (= P 5593, *mngon pa'i bstan bcos, chu* 31b7–32a3); cf. also Si-T 3321, *mgon pa, ngu* 899,15–900,6 with apparatus vol. 80, p. 1657: *bla ma'i chos khas blangs pas zhes bya ba ni bla ma'i chos brgyad po*: (7) *dge slong ma* (D; P omits: *ma*) *bsnyen par rdzogs nas lo brgya lon pas kyang dge slong bsnyen* (P; D: *bstan*) *par rdzogs ma thag pa la phyag bya ba dang* (5) *dge slong mas gang du yang dge slong gi gi skyon gleng par mi bya zhes bya ba de lta bu la sogs pa ste de dag khas blangs pas de bsnyen par rdzogs par gyur to 'di skad du dge slong las bsnyen par rdzogs rdzogs shing dge slong ma'i dngos par bya ba dang* (2) *zla ba phyed cing dge slong ma* (D; P omits: *ma*) *la gdams ngag gnod* (P;

- D: *mnod*) *par bya ba dang* (3) *dbyar dge slong med pa'i gnas su 'gro bar mi bya ba dang* (4) *dgag dbye'i tshé gnyi ga'i dge 'dun la la gnas gsum gyis dgag dbye bya ba dang* (8) *dge slong gi ltung ba gleng bar mi bya ba dang ltung ba byung byung ba la khro bar mi* (D; P omits: *mi*) *bya ba dang* (6) *bla ma'i chos kyi ltung ba byung byung na zla ba phyed du mnyes par bya spyad par bya ba dang* (7) *bsnyen par rdzogs nas* (D; P omits: *nas*) *lo rdzogs nas lo brgya lon pas dge slong gsar bu la phyag bya ba – zhes bya ba* (D; P omits: *zhes bya ba*) *brgyad yin no zhes 'chad do*. In addition to sequence variations compared to the Sanskrit, the Tibetan text appears to have suffered a transmission or copy error since the first and last *gurudharmas* appear to be the same rule, thus both corresponding to the seventh *gurudharma* in the Sanskrit text.
26. This text was first edited by Ridding and de la Vallée Poussin 1920 and newly edited by Schmidt 1993. For the dating of the manuscript see Schmidt 1993: 240. A free English rendering by Wilson was published in Paul 1985: 83–87 and a partial translation by Krey 2010: 60–63. The notes to the summary and translated excerpts of the Tibetan Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya* version in Finnegan 2009: 311–316 compare it with the so-called *Bhikṣuṇī-karmavācānā*. On the Mūlasarvāstivāda affiliation of this Sanskrit text see Roth 1970: 5, Yuyama 1979: 37 (§ 1.41), Schmidt 1994, Chung 1998: 420 and Finnegan 2009: 310 note 591.
27. Chung 1998: 420–421; cf. also Chung 1997: 40 note 7.
28. For recent overviews of the corpus of *Vinaya* texts identified as Mūlasarvāstivāda see Kishino 2013: 6–24 and the bibliographical survey of the extant Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya* materials in the Gilgit manuscripts in Clarke 2014b: 16–45. On an at least twofold (perhaps threefold) rather than single Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya* tradition see Silk 2008: 113–114 note 44, Martini 2012: 440–441, Emms 2012, Yao 2013: 1133–1134, Clarke 2014: 224–225 note 138; Borgland 2014, Clarke 2015, Dhammadinnā 2015a: 29–30 and Yao 2015b: 294.
29. Dhammadinnā in preparation.
30. The Tibetan *Abhidharmakośavyākhyā* appears to have suffered a transmission error; cf. note 25 above.
31. The translated section goes from D 6, 'dul ba, da 100a4 to 104b4 (= P 1035, 'dul ba, ne 97a7 to 101b8); cf. also the collated Tanjur, Si-K 6, 'dul ba, da 240,10 to 251,15 with apparatus vol. 11, pp. 858–860. Here and in the next translation, variant readings are noted only when they significantly affect the translation. A critical edition of the text (including a study in the light of the Mūlasarvāstivāda commentarial tradition) is under preparation by bhikṣuṇī Jampa Tsedroen. Here and in the following translation, the headings for the similes or the *gurudharmas* inserted within square brackets are not found in the original and are given to facilitate comparison with the parallel versions. Annotations on the main variations between the Sanskrit, Chinese and Tibetan versions are in given in the footnotes to the translation of the Chinese Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya* parallel in Anālayo 2016a: 208–216; in the footnotes to my translation I do not repeat the comparative information already supplied by him.
32. D 6, 'dul ba, da 101b2 (= P 1035, 'dul ba, ne 97b4), with no variant readings recorded in Si-K 6, 'dul ba, da 241,7: *gos dkar po*, white robes or clothes.
33. Cf. the so-called Sanskrit *Bhikṣuṇī-karmavācānā*, Schmidt 1993: 242,5–8: *evam eva tvaṃ gautamī munḍā samghātiprāvṛtā yāvajjīvaṃ kevalaṃ paripūrṇaṃ pariśuddhaṃ paryavadātaṃ bra[h](maca)ryaṃ cara tat tava bhaviṣyati dīrgharātram arthāya hitāya s[u] khāye ti*. An error in the translation of *kevalaṃ* (Tib. 'ba' *zhig pa la*) read as an adverb “alone” rather than an adjective in the accusative singular by Finnegan 2009: 311 in the Sanskrit modular phrase *kevalaṃ paripūrṇaṃ pariśuddhaṃ paryavadātaṃ brahmacaryaṃ cara*, rendered as “... practice brahmacarya ... alone, fully, purely and perfectly” (cf. also p. 311, note 596) leads to a misrepresentation of the Buddha's injunction: “Departing significantly from the Sanskrit manuscript, the Tibetan has Buddha suggesting that she keep the outward appearance of a lay householder while practicing brahmacarya alone in private at home. The Sanskrit effectively is allowing her to live fully as a monastic, but not as part of a female community” (p. 311, note 596) and “in the *MSV* [Mūlasarvāstivāda

- Vinaya*) ... [the] Buddha tells her ... [to] practice *brahmacarya*, but alone at home” (ibid., p. 312). The Tibetan text, D 6, *'dul ba, da 100b2* (= P 1035, *'dul ba, ne 97b4*) should be segmented as follows: *'ba' zhiḡ pa la* (= *kevalam*) *yongs su rdzogs pa* (= *paripūrnam*) *yongs su dag pa* (= *pariśuddham*) *yongs su byang bar* (= *pariyavādātam*) *tshangs par spyad pa spyod cig* (= *brahmacaryam carati*). (The passage translated by Finnegan is placed before the beginning of the Sanskrit manuscript, she translates from the Sanskrit where it appears in the later repetition; cf. Finnegan 2009: 311 note 597.) A similar oversight is found in Wilson in Paul 1979/1985: 83 (“just you alone ... will be fulfilled, purified and cleansed”). On this modular phrase cf., e.g., von Simson 1965: 54,18 (§ 11.55) and Bechert et al. 2003: 123; cf. also Krey 2010: 61 note 73 and Anālayo 2016a: 51–52 and 210 note 6.
34. D 6, *'dul ba, da 101a1* (= P 1035, *'dul ba, ne 98a1*) with no variant readings recorded in Si-K 6, *'dul ba, da 242,3*: *chos gos*, lit. ‘Dharma robes’, which usually stands for *civara* as (set of) monastic robes in general or for the *saṅghāṭī*, the upper robe of a Buddhist monastic. On the designation of the robes worn or to be worn by Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī in the parallels see Anālayo 2016a: 209–210 note 5.
  35. D 6, *'dul ba, da 101a1* (= P 1035, *'dul ba, ne 98a1*) with no variant readings recorded in Si-K 6, *'dul ba, da 242,9*: *shyar ma gyon*.
  36. This is the Tiled Residence in Nāḍika of Mūlasarvāstivāda literature, which corresponds to Nāḍika Giṅjikāvasatha in the Pali tradition; cf., e.g., Lamotte 1970: III.1659–1660 note 3.
  37. Specific mention of the storm is only made in the Derge edition, D 6, *'dul ba, da 102a3*: *ser ba'i 'khor lo mi bzad pa babs na*, with a parallel in the so-called *Bhikṣuṇī-karmavācānā*, Schmidt 1993: 244,6, *aśanir nipata dvirvagrā* (Ridding and de la Vallée Poussin 1920: 125 reads *aśanir nirpatet vidyuc cakrā*), but it is absent at the corresponding juncture in the Peking edition (as well as in the Lithang, Cone and Yongle editions according to the apparatus in Si-K 6, *'dul ba, da 245,5–6* with notes 11–12, vol. 11, p. 859) and in the Chinese parallel; cf. Anālayo 2016a: 212 note 14.
  38. Here the text, D 6, *'dul ba, da 103a5* (= P 1035, *'dul ba, ne 100a8*) has the word *nyes pa'i* (genitive case, ‘fault’, ‘offence’ etc.), which seems an error for *dge slong ma'i* in *dge slong ma'i dngos po*, the condition or state of being a nun, nunhood, as indicated by the variant reading *dge slong ma'i dngos po* in the Urga, Narthang and Zhol edition recorded in Si-K 6, *'dul ba, da 248,2* with note 3 in vol. 111, p. 860. Cf., e.g., D 6, *'dul ba, da 100b1* (= P 1035, *'dul ba, ne 97b3*): *dge slong ma'i dngos po* and D 6, *'dul ba, da 104a7* (= P 1035, *'dul ba, ne 101b2*): *ḡi ni dge slong ma'i dngos po yin no*; cf. also the corresponding juncture in T 1451 at T XXIV 351b11.
  39. Similar to the Tibetan text, the so-called Sanskrit *Bhikṣuṇī-karmavācā*, Schmidt 1993: 247,2ult, repeats the other *gurudharmas* in full. The Chinese Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya* abbreviates and indicates that in the same way Ānanda announced them in full up to the end, T 1451 at T XXIV 351b23.
  40. Gautamī’s response is lacking in the so-called *Bhikṣuṇī-karmavācānā* fragment which has a lacuna at this juncture.
  41. Up 4024; a collated edition with full references is given as an appendix to this paper. The sequence of the *gurudharmas* matches with those in the Tibetan *Kṣudrakavastu*, in the so-called Sanskrit *Bhikṣuṇī-karmavācānā*, and in the Chinese translation of the *Madhyama-āgama* (MĀ 116; albeit with a discrepancy in the fifth and sixth *gurudharmas*), but not with that in the Chinese *Kṣudrakavastu* (nor, obviously, with its *uddāna*), and in the Sanskrit and Tibetan *Abhidharmakośavyākhyā*. A detailed discussion of sequence and wording variations is given in Dhammadinnā in preparation.
  42. The quotation taken up by Śamathadeva is located in the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya* on *Abhidharmakośa* IV.26, Pradhan 212,6: *gurudharmābhyupagamena mahāprajāpatyāḥ*; Tibetan translation in D 4090, *mṅgon pa, ku 180b3–4* (= P 5591, *mdo 'grel (mṅgon pa), gu 208a3–6*): *bla ma'i chos khas blangs pas ni skye dgu'i bdag mo chen mo'o*; Chinese in T 1559 (Paramārtha) at T XXIX 231c24–25: 六由信受八尊法得大戒。如大瞿耽彌 and T 1558 (Xuanzang (玄奘)) at T XXIX 74c1–2: 六由敬受八尊重法。謂大生主 (translated in de la Vallée Poussin 1980: III.61).
  43. The title of the discourse is given as *skye dgu'i* (CD; GNP: *dgu*) *bdag mo chen mo'i mdo at*



C, *ju* 212b7; D, *ju* 212b7; G 3598, *tu* 319b1; N, *tu* 234a4; P 5595, *tu* 242b6 and Si-T 3323 *ju* 519,6, with the same variant readings between the editions occurring in Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī's name in the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya* citation above (for spelling differences in this proper name in the rest of the discourse extract see the collated edition below). The reference for the so far unidentified source of the discourse extract, *mm grangs mm par bshad pa'i mthar*, is tentatively reconstructed in Honjō 1984: 57 as *\*paryāyavyākhyāne antima-*.

44. Cf. Schmidt 1993: 244,13–15.
45. Cf. Schmidt 1993: 244,21–25.
46. Cf. Schmidt 1993: 244,26–245,3.
47. Cf. Schmidt 1993: 245,4–7.
48. Cf. Schmidt 1993: 245,8–11.
49. The translation adopts the reading *dge slong mas dge slong la rtsod pa* from C, *ju* 213a7, D 4094, *ju* 213b1 and Si-T 3323, *ju* 520,15, whereas G, *tu* 320a5–6, N, *tu* 234b6 and P 5595, *tu* 243a8–b1 read *ma* for *la*.
50. The translation 'breach of conduct' follows *spyod pa'i skyon* in G 3598, *tu* 320a5, N, *tu* 234b5 and P 5595, *tu* 243a7 instead of 'breach of thought', *dpyod pa'i skyon*, in C, *ju* 213a7, D 4094, *mngon pa*, *ju* 213b1 and Si-T 3323, *ju* 520,13; the same variations occur below.
51. The translation adopts the reading *dge slong gis dge slong ma la ... dran par byed pa ni dgag pa ma yin no* from G 3598, *tu* 320a6–b1, N, *tu* 234b6–7, P 5595, *tu* 242a8–243b2, C, *ju* 213b1–2, D 4094, *ju* 213b1–2 and Si-T 3323, *ju* 520,17–19 add *mi* in *dran par mi byed pa ni*.
52. Cf. Schmidt 1993: 245,12–19.
53. Cf. Schmidt 1993: 245,20–246,3.
54. Cf. Schmidt 1993: 246,4–7.
55. Cf. Schmidt 1993: 246,8–12.
56. Cf. Schmidt 1993: 246,13–15.
57. Cf. Schmidt 1993: 246,16–24.

